

REVIEW
of the official reviewer of the dissertation work of Ashimova Aitolkyn Berikkyzy on the topic "Artificial Intelligence as an Instrument of Political Communication: Application and Global Forecasting", submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program "8D03202 Media and Communications"

№	Criteria	Compliance with the criteria (underline one of the answer options)	Justification of the official reviewer's position (comments should be highlighted in italics)
1.	The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programs	<p>1.1 Compliance with priority areas of scientific development or state programs:</p> <p>1) the dissertation was completed within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (indicate the name and number of the project or program);</p> <p>2) the dissertation was completed within the framework of another state program (indicate the name of the program);</p> <p>3) <u>the dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of scientific development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (indicate direction).</u></p>	<p>The topic of the dissertation research, “Artificial Intelligence as a Tool of Political Communication: Application and Global Forecasting,” corresponds to the priority areas of political science development in the Republic of Kazakhstan, as outlined in national programs and regulatory documents, including: the Strategic Development Plan of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2025 (Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 636 dated February 15, 2018); the Law on Informatization of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 24, 2015, No. 418-V ZRK; and the national project “Quality Education ‘Educated Nation’” (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 12, 2021, No. 726).</p>

2.	Importance for Science	The work makes/does not make a significant contribution to science, and its importance is/is not well explained.	
3.	The principle of independence	Level of independence:	Aitolkyn Ashimova demonstrated a high level of independence in completing the dissertation research, which certainly indicates a personal contribution to the field of political science and journalism. The scientific results were obtained by the applicant independently based on a theoretical analysis of the works of domestic and foreign scientists, structuring and classifying information, systemic and comparative analysis of the results of international studies, and modeling of political communication.
		1) <u>high</u> ;	
		2) medium;	
		3) low;	
		4) no independence.	
4.	The principle of internal unity	4.1 Justification of the relevance of the dissertation:	The relevance of the dissertation topic "Artificial Intelligence as a Tool of Political Communication: Application and Global Forecasting" is substantiated in a comprehensive and well-reasoned manner. The author described in detail the impact of global digitalization and artificial intelligence on the transformation of political communication, both in the international and Kazakhstani contexts. References
		1) <u>justified</u> ;	
		2) partially justified;	
		3) not justified.	

			are provided to strategic documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan (for example, the Strategic Development Plan until 2025, the Law on Informatization, national projects), confirming the importance of the topic at the state level. In addition, the dynamics of AI development and its impact on political processes are reflected, including the growth of generative technologies and changes in the model of interaction between government and society.
		4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the topic of the dissertation:	The topic of the dissertation is fully disclosed in the content of the work. The structure of the dissertation is logical and covers all the key aspects of the stated topic. The first chapter is devoted to the historical and theoretical analysis of the development of artificial intelligence in the context of political communications, as well as its role in the media and global governance. The second chapter examines the processes of digitalization of the political sphere, as well as the concepts and methods of computer propaganda, demonstrating the practical application of AI in
		1) <u>completely reflects;</u>	
		2) partially reflects;	
		3) does not reflect.	

			<p>modern political communication. The third chapter contains a comprehensive analysis of the Kazakhstan context, including an assessment of the current state of AI, the construction of a global predictive model of political communication with AI and the analysis of an expert survey on the perception of AI in the political process. The work also presents regulatory sources, definitions of key terms and a questionnaire of experts, which confirms the scientific validity and practical focus of the study. Thus, the content of the dissertation is fully consistent with the stated topic.</p>
		4.3. The aim and objectives correspond to the topic of the dissertation:	<p>The aim and objectives of the dissertation research logically follow from the stated topic and cover key aspects: analysis of the impact of AI on political communication, forecasting trends, research of the Kazakhstani and international context. The formulations are specific, justified and correspond to the direction of scientific research.</p>
		1) <u>correspond</u> ;	
		2) partially correspond;	
		3) does not correspond.	
		4.4 All sections and provisions of the dissertation are logically interconnected:	<p>The dissertation research has internal unity, all sections are</p>

		1) <u>completely interconnected</u> ;	logically interconnected; scientific provisions and obtained data reflect the progress and results of solving the tasks set, are subject to a single research methodology. In general, the dissertation research is structured, characterized by the persuasiveness of the provisions put forward.
		2) partially interconnected;	
		3) no interconnection.	
		4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are substantiated and evaluated in comparison with known solutions:	The author has conducted a comprehensive critical analysis of existing approaches to the use of AI in political communication. The work presents its own conclusions and substantiates new solutions, including a forecast model and the adaptation of SWOT and PEST methods to political discourse. A significant contribution is the expert survey among media specialists, political scientists and data analysts, the results of which are reasonably included in the analysis and confirm the stated hypotheses. The author demonstrates scientific independence and a high level of analytical elaboration of the material.
		1) <u>contains critical analysis</u> ;	
		2) partial critical analysis;	
		3) the analysis does not represent personal opinions, but quotes from other authors;	
		4) there is no analysis.	
5.	The principle of scientific novelty	5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new?	The dissertation adheres to the principle of scientific novelty: the dissertation contains new
		1) <u>completely new</u> ;	

		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	scientifically substantiated theoretical and empirical results, the totality of which is of great importance for the development of political science and journalism in Kazakhstan. Main scientific results: theoretical and methodological prerequisites for the emergence of artificial intelligence are analyzed; basic aspects of the digitalization of political propaganda are identified; new means of political communication and social risks associated with the digitalization of public policy are described; methods of using artificial intelligence in the media are made public; the current state and prospects for the development of artificial intelligence in the media of Kazakhstan are determined; a model for global forecasting of the development of political communications with the integration of artificial intelligence based on the experience of Kazakhstan is developed.
		3) not new (less than 25% are new).	
		5.2 Are the conclusions of the dissertation new?	The conclusions of the dissertation are completely new, since for the first time in Kazakhstani scientific practice a
		1) completely new;	
		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	

		3) not new (less than 25% are new).	comprehensive analysis of the impact of artificial intelligence on political communication has been conducted. An original model of its transformation from linear to interactive and transactional has been developed, SWOT and PEST analyses have been applied to assess the development of AI in the political context of Kazakhstan. The novelty is also confirmed by the results of an expert survey, which revealed a positive perception of AI in politics among the professional community. These results have not previously been studied in a comprehensive manner.
		5.3 Technical, technological, economic or managerial decisions are new and justified:	The dissertation presents completely new and substantiated technical, technological and managerial solutions. For the first time, a model for forecasting political communication with AI integration has been developed, adapted to the Kazakhstani context. The use of SWOT and PEST analysis allowed for a deep assessment of internal and external factors influencing the digital transformation of the political sphere. Methodologically and empirically substantiated
		<u>1) completely new;</u>	
		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	
		3) not new (less than 25% are new).	

			conclusions open up opportunities for practical application in public administration, media and analytics.
6.	Validity of key findings	All key findings are based/not based on sound scientific evidence or are reasonably well supported (for qualitative research and arts and humanities majors).	All the main conclusions are based on scientifically sound evidence and are well-founded enough for a qualitative study in the humanities and social sciences. The author applied a comprehensive approach: used theoretical analysis, SWOT and PEST methods, conducted an expert survey and statistical data processing. This ensured the reliability of the results and the validity of the conclusions made.
7.	The main provisions submitted for defense	The following questions must be answered for each provision separately:	Provision 1 is proven, as the use of AI tools in political campaigns is confirmed by numerous studies and real cases, such as the activities of Cambridge Analytica. This proposition is not trivial, since, despite the fact that bots are used, the thesis about the potential transition of AI from an intermediary to a key role in communication is a non-trivial statement. The novelty of the proposition requires clarification: the first part (about the use of bots) is not new, but the forecast
		7.1 Is the proposition proven?	
		1) <u>proven</u> ;	
		2) rather proven;	
		3) rather not proven;	
		4) not proven;	
		5) in the current formulation it is impossible to check the provenness of the proposition.	
		7.2 Is it trivial?	
		1) yes;	
		2) <u>no</u> ;	
		3) in the current formulation it is impossible to verify the triviality of the position.	

		7.3 Is it new?	<p>about the expansion of AI functions may contain novelty. The level of application is broad, since the proposition concerns global trends in political communication.</p> <p>Provision 2 is proven because the existence of generative AI models (e.g., ChatGPT) and their growing influence on content creation are widely recognized facts. It is not trivial because, although the fact of generative AI development is widely known, the thesis about the increasing complexity of audience interaction with AI content and the emergence of AI assistants for navigation in the media space adds depth to the analysis. The proposition can be considered new because the role of AI assistants in media consumption has not yet been sufficiently studied. The level of application is wide, since it affects various areas, including media, marketing and education.</p> <p>Provision 3 is more likely to be proven if it is based on specific SWOT and PEST analysis data for Kazakhstan. Without reference to a specific study, its validity can be questioned. It is not trivial,</p>
		1) <u>yes</u> ;	
		2) no;	
		3) in the current formulation it is impossible to verify the novelty of the provision.	
		7.4 Level of application:	
		1) narrow;	
		2) medium;	
		3) <u>wide</u> ;	
		4) in the current wording it is impossible to verify the level of application of the provision.	
		7.5 Is the article proven?	
		1) <u>yes</u> ;	
		2) no;	
		3) in its current formulation, it is impossible to verify the provenness of the position in the article.	

			<p>since a comprehensive analysis of the interaction of the state, business and population for the implementation of AI is a significant and non-obvious idea. Novelty depends on the context: if such studies have not been conducted for Kazakhstan before, the provision can be considered new. The level of application is medium, since it is focused on a specific country, but can be adapted for other developing economies.</p> <p>Provision 4 is proven, since the convergence of traditional media and digital platforms, as well as the change in the direction of information flows, are widely described in the scientific literature. It is not trivial, since the thesis about the potential transformation of communication platforms under the influence of AI goes beyond the generally known facts. The novelty of the provision lies in the forecast of a complete change in communication models due to AI, which has not yet been sufficiently studied. The level of application is broad, since it</p>
--	--	--	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

			<p>concerns global changes in the media environment.</p> <p>Provision 5 is rather proven, since the connection between the development of AI and the transition from campaigning to personalized political marketing is confirmed by a number of studies, but requires deeper empirical testing. It is not trivial, since the opposition of traditional campaigning and individually oriented communication through AI is a meaningful analysis. The novelty of the proposition is high, since the topic of using generative AI to personalize political discourse has not been studied much yet. The level of application is average, since the focus on political communication narrows the audience, but the findings may be useful for political scientists and marketers.</p> <p>Provision 6 is proven, since the evolution of communication models (linear, interactive, transactional) corresponds to the historical stages of media development. It is not trivial, despite the popularity of the models themselves, their application to political</p>
--	--	--	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

			communication with an emphasis on the role of AI adds analytical value. The novelty is moderate, since the models themselves are not new, but their adaptation to modern AI technologies can be considered relatively new. The level of application is broad, as the provision covers the evolution of media in a global context.
8.	Principle of reliability.	8.1 The choice of methodology is justified or the methodology is described in sufficient detail:	The principle of reliability in the dissertation is observed. The reliability and validity of the results of the dissertation research is ensured by the validity, consistency of theoretical approaches to the phenomenon under study and compliance with scientific principles and rules for conducting research, adequate selection of research methods widely used in modern political science, their verification for reliability and complementarity. The reliability of the research is also achieved by relying on a sufficient number of foreign and domestic studies on artificial intelligence in the field of political communication.
	Reliability of sources and information provided	<u>1) yes;</u>	
		2) no;	

		8.2 The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technologies:	The dissertation uses modern methods of scientific research, including historical-philosophical, structural-functional and comparative analysis, as well as content analysis. The IBM SPSS Statistics program was used to process the expert survey data, which ensured the reliability and interpretability of the results using computer technologies and statistical analysis methods.
		<u>1) yes;</u>	
		2) no;	
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns are proven and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results are proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment):	The theoretical conclusions, developed models, as well as the identified relationships and patterns were confirmed in the course of the experimental study. The conducted expert survey and statistical analysis of the data confirmed the validity and reliability of the proposed concepts, which indicates the high scientific value and practical applicability of the dissertation results.
		<u>1) yes;</u>	
		2) no;	
		8.4 Important claims are supported/partially supported/not supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.	Important claims in the dissertation are supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature, which ensures the scientific validity of the work. In some cases, the support is partial, which is due to the limited research in this area, but overall a

			wide range of modern sources is used.
		8.5 The literature sources used are sufficient/not sufficient for a literature review.	The sources of literature used are sufficient for a full-fledged literature review. They cover key areas and modern research on the topic of the dissertation, which allows for a comprehensive examination of the subject of the study and justification of the relevance and novelty of the work.
9	The principle of practical value	9.1 The dissertation has theoretical significance:	The work makes a significant contribution to the development of theoretical foundations of the interaction of artificial intelligence and political communication, proposing new models and approaches confirmed by empirical research and analysis of modern trends.
		<u>1) yes;</u>	
		2) no.	
		9.2 The dissertation has practical significance and there is a high probability of applying the obtained results in practice:	The dissertation has practical significance, and there is a high probability of applying the obtained results in practice. The developed models and recommendations can be used by government agencies, media, research centers and political organizations to improve communication strategies and
		<u>1) yes;</u>	
		2) no.	

			introduce artificial intelligence into political processes, which contributes to increasing the effectiveness and relevance of political dialogue.
		9.3 The practical proposals are new:	The practical proposals are completely new, as they are based on a comprehensive analysis of the impact of artificial intelligence on political communication and media digitalization. The developed models and recommendations take into account modern technological and social trends, which allows them to be effectively applied in the context of the rapid development of digital technologies and a changing political environment.
		<u>1) completely new;</u>	
		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	
		3) not new (less than 25% are new).	
10.	Quality of writing and formatting	Quality of academic writing:	The quality of academic writing of the dissertation can be assessed as high. The text is structured logically, the argumentation is consistent and supported by scientific data. The academic style used corresponds to the requirements of scientific publications, which contributes to a clear and convincing presentation of the material.
<u>1) high;</u>			
2) average;			
3) below average;			
4) low.			
11.	Comments on the dissertation	The author demonstrates a high level of knowledge of the topic, which sometimes leads to the text being saturated with terms and concepts. Clarification of individual definitions would help make the presentation	

		more accessible to a broad scientific audience. This would not only expand the readership but also enhance the applied significance of the study by more clearly presenting key provisions.
12.	The scientific level of the doctoral student's articles on the research topic (in the case of defending a dissertation in the form of a series of articles, official reviewers comment on the scientific level of each doctoral student's article on the research topic)	The scientific level of the doctoral student's articles can be characterized as high, which is confirmed by a number of aspects. First of all, the articles were published in international and domestic peer-reviewed scientific journals, such as the Journal of Applied Journalism & Media Studies ("Gender Division and Television Consumption in Kazakhstan", 2023) and the Journal of Information Policy ("Digital Literacy as a Tool for Identifying Fake News: A Comparative Analysis Using the Example of European and Kazakh Media", 2025), included in the Scopus database, which indicates recognition of the quality of the research conducted at the international level. The topics of the articles fully correspond to the direction of the dissertation research, covering both theoretical aspects - the development of artificial intelligence, political communication, media automation (New Horizons of Visualization: the Role of AI in Modern Journalism in Kazakhstan, SWOT and PEST Analysis of Artificial Intelligence in Kazakhstan), and applied ones - digital literacy, media consumption, analytical methods (Digital Media Preferences in the Focus of Social Research, SWOT Analysis of the Current State and Prospects for the Development of Artificial Intelligence in Kazakhstan's Media Industry). The methodological elaboration of the materials is manifested in the use of modern methods of scientific analysis: SWOT and PEST analysis, comparative analysis, expert surveys and empirical research. It is worth noting separately the interdisciplinary approach, combining knowledge and methods from media studies, political science, sociology and information technology, which gives the doctoral student's scientific work both novelty and analytical depth.
13.	Decision of the official reviewer (in accordance with paragraph 28 of these Model Regulations)	Dissertation research of Ashimova Aitolkyn "Artificial Intelligence as an Instrument of Political Communication: Application and Global Forecasting" is a completed scientific research. The work is performed at a high level and the applicant Ashimova Aitolkyn deserves to be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program "8D03202 - Media and Communications".

Official Reviewer:

Candidate of Philological Sciences, Associate Professor,
Head of the Department of Psycholinguistics,
A. Baitursynuly Institute of Linguistics



M. Abayeva

Abayeva M.K.

(аты-жөні)	
қолын куәландырамын	
«А.Байтұрсынұлы атындағы Тіл білімі институты» РМК Персоналды басқару, құжаттамамен қамтамасыз ету және бақылау бөлімі	
« 24 »	2025 ж.